



PRISON LAW OFFICE  
General Delivery, San Quentin CA. 94964  
Telephone (510) 280-2621 • Fax (510) 280-2704  
www.prisonlaw.com

Director:  
Donald Specter

Staff Attorneys:  
Susan Christian  
Rebekah Evenson  
Steven Farna  
Penny Godbold  
Megan Hagler  
Kelly Knapp  
Alison Hardy  
Millard Murphy  
Sara Norman  
Judith Rosenberg  
Zoe Schonfeld  
E. Ivan Trujillo

Your Responsibility When Using the Information Provided Below:

When putting this material together, we did our best to give you useful and accurate information and cannot give specific advice to all prisoners who ask for it. The laws change often and can be looked at in different ways. We do not always have the resources to make changes to this material every time the law changes. If you want legal advice backed by a guarantee, try to hire a lawyer to address your specific problem. If you use this pamphlet, it is your responsibility to make sure that the law has not changed and still applies to your situation. Most of the materials you need should be available in your institution's law library.

**INFORMATION REGARDING PROPOSITION 9**  
(11/17/08)

The following information is a summary of some of the changes in California law resulting from Proposition 9,<sup>1</sup> which was passed by the voters on November 4, 2008. Proposition 9 modified the California Constitution and altered the California Penal Code by amending two statutes and adding two additional statutes. The main changes impacting prisoners are (1) changes in the procedures for granting parole to life prisoners and for revoking parole; (2) the payment of restitution by criminal offenders; (3) restriction of the early release of prisoners; and (4) limitations on the rights of prisoners.

The following is a discussion of changes that impact individuals after they have been convicted and sentenced - please note this discussion is not meant to be comprehensive and there are portions of the Proposition that are not discussed. The proposition, in its entirety, is attached to this document.

**I. CHANGES IN THE PROCEDURES FOR GRANTING AND REVOKING PAROLE**

**A. Scheduling Parole Consideration Hearings for Life Prisoners (Pen. Code § 3041.5)**

Before the passage of Proposition 9, when a prisoner facing a life sentence was denied a parole date, s/he was entitled to an annual parole hearing unless the Board of Parole Hearings (BPH) found that it was not reasonable to expect that parole would be granted the following year and stated the bases for the finding. The next hearing could be delayed up to two years in non-murder cases and up to five years in murder cases.

With the passage of Proposition 9, the period between parole hearings (following a denial) has changed. The new law, as written, lacks clarity and this issue will likely be litigated. For example, there may be a legal argument that the law should not be applied to persons who committed their crimes before the passage of the law. This is because the "ex post facto" clauses of the federal and state

<sup>1</sup> Proposition 9 is also known as "Marsy's Law."

Board of Directors

Penelope Cooper, President • Michele WalkinHawk, Vice President • Marshall Krause, Treasurer  
Honorable John Burton • Felecia Gaston • Christiane Hipps • Margaret Johns  
Cesar Lagleva • Laura Magnani • Michael Marcum • Ruth Morgan • Dennis Roberts

constitutions prohibit the government from increasing punishment for a crime after the crime was committed.<sup>2</sup>

It appears to be the case that hearings will no longer be held annually and may not be scheduled for up to 15 years after the denial of parole. The scheduling timeframe provision (Pen. Code § 3041.5, subd. (b)(3)) is as follows:

The board shall schedule the next hearing, after considering the views and interests of the victim, as follows:

- (A) Fifteen years after any hearing at which parole is denied, unless the board finds by clear and convincing evidence that the criteria relevant to the setting of parole related dates enumerated in subdivision (a) of Section 3041 are such that consideration of the public and victim's safety does not require a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner than 10 additional years.
- (B) Ten years after any hearing at which parole is denied, unless the board finds by clear and convincing evidence that the criteria relevant to the setting of parole release dates enumerated in subdivision (a) of Section 3041 are such that consideration of the public and victim's safety does not require a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner than seven additional years.
- (C) Three years, five years, or seven years after any hearing at which parole is denied, because the criteria relevant to the setting of parole release dates enumerated in subdivision (a) of Section 3041 are such that consideration of the public and victim's safety requires a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner, but does not require a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner than seven additional years.

Once the hearing is scheduled, the BPH has discretion to advance a hearing date if there is a change in circumstances or new information establishing a reasonable likelihood that the public's safety does not require the additional years of incarceration. A prisoner may make one written request every three years (including a copy for the victim) to advance the hearing date describing the changed circumstances or new information.

Before the passage of Proposition 9, when the BPH rescinded a previously set parole date, the BPH was required to schedule the next hearing within 12 months. Now, the BPH must follow the same scheduling guidelines as described in § 3041.5(b)(3) above after rescinding a previously set parole date.

#### **B. Expansion of the Rights of Victims at Parole Consideration Hearings for Life Prisoners (Pen. Code §§ 3041.5(a)(2) and 3043)**

Proposition 9 expanded the rights of victims to attend and to be heard at various criminal proceedings, including parole consideration hearings for life prisoners. The victim, next of kin, members of the victim's family, and two representatives may now attend and are entitled to testify at parole consideration hearings. Their testimony may include their views on the parolee's previous convictions, the effect of the crimes on the victim and their families, and the suitability of the prisoner for parole. The BPH is required to consider the entire and uninterrupted statements of all of these persons in deciding whether to release the prisoner on parole, and the prisoner or parolee's attorney are not entitled to ask questions of them. In addition, victims and their representatives can require that

---

<sup>2</sup> U.S. Const., art. I, §10; Ca. Const., art 1, § 9; see *Miller v. Florida* (1987) 482 U.S. 423; *Lynce v. Mathis* (1997) 519 U.S. 433.

transcripts of their statements be provided to every hearing panel that considers the prisoner's parole in the future. This means that any false or misleading statements will remain in the file.

### C. Parole Revocation Proceedings (Pen. Code § 3044)

Proposition 9 includes several provisions that curtail parolees' due process rights in parole revocation proceedings. These provisions directly conflict with the permanent injunction in *Valdivia v. Davis*, a 2004 federal court order establishing those rights. Plaintiffs' counsel filed a motion in federal court to enforce the *Valdivia* injunction on November 14, 2008.

- **Appointment of an Attorney** – Parolees will no longer automatically be appointed an attorney in parole revocation proceedings. Parolees must request appointment of an attorney. BPH will only grant the request if the parolee is indigent and if he or she appears to be incapable of speaking effectively in his or her own defense due to the complexity of the charges, the defense, or the parolee's mental or educational incapacity.
- **Probable Cause Hearing** – Prior to the passage of Proposition 9, the BPH was required to conduct a probable cause hearing no later than 13 business days after a parolee has been arrested. Now a parolee is entitled to a probable cause hearing no later than 15 days following his or her arrest for a violation of parole.
- **Revocation Hearing** – Prior to the passage of Proposition 9, the BPH was required to conduct a final revocation hearing no later than 35 days after placement of a parole hold. Now a parolee is entitled to a revocation hearing no later than 45 days following his or her arrest for a violation of parole.
- **Hearsay Evidence** – Hearsay evidence offered by parole agents, peace officers, or a victim shall be admitted at parole revocation hearings, but does not create a right for prisoners or their attorneys to confront the witness at the hearing.
- **Elimination of Various Due Process Rights** – The *Valdivia* injunction and controlling case law also obligated the BPH to provide a number of additional due process rights to parolees such as written notice of charges, the right of the parolee to appear and speak on his or her own behalf at the probable cause hearing, a neutral hearing officer, the right to subpoena witnesses and evidence, the consideration of alternatives to incarceration, a written statement by the factfinder of the evidence relied on and reasons for revoking parole, and access to an audiotape of the parole revocation hearing. Proposition 9 eliminates these rights.

## II. THE PAYMENT OF RESTITUTION BY CRIMINAL OFFENDERS

Proposition 9 added Subdivision (b)(13) to Article I, Section 28, of the California Constitution to require the court to order restitution for every case in which a crime victim suffers a loss. Any funds collected by a court or law enforcement agencies will first be applied to restitution. Restitution may therefore be effectively prioritized over other fines and obligations a prisoner may legally owe.

### **III. RESTRICTION OF THE EARLY RELEASE OF PRISONERS**

Proposition 9 amended Article I, Section 28(f), of the California Constitution to state that sentences must be carried out in compliance with the court's sentencing orders and prisoners' sentences shall not be "substantially diminished" by early release policies intended to alleviate overcrowding. It also requires the legislature to provide enough funds to house prisoners for the full terms of their sentences, although statutorily authorized credits will still be permitted to reduce prisoners' sentences.

### **IV. LIMITATIONS ON THE RIGHTS OF PRISONERS**

Proposition 9 added Subdivision (a)(5) to Article I, Section 28, of the California Constitution to limit the rights and privileges of prisoners to those required by the United States Constitution and the laws of California. It is unclear how this provision will affect prisoners, but it could potentially negate various rights and privileges now afforded to prisoners such as visitation, higher education, and recreational programming. In the event the CDCR uses this provision to interfere with court-ordered consent decrees requiring the CDCR to provide prisoners with various rights beyond those mandated by state and federal law, there will likely be litigation to enforce those rights.

consistent with Section 25740.1, the Public Utilities Commission shall encourage and give the highest priority to allocations for the construction of, or payment to supplement the construction of, any new or modified electric transmission facilities necessary to facilitate the state achieving its renewables portfolio standard targets.

(c) All projects receiving funding, in whole or in part, pursuant to this section shall be considered public works projects subject to the provisions of Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 1720) of Part 7 of Division 2 of the Labor Code, and the Department of Industrial Relations shall have the same authority and responsibility to enforce those provisions as it has under the Labor Code.

SEC. 28. Section 25745 is added to the Public Resources Code, to read; 25745. The Energy Commission shall use its best efforts to attract and encourage investment in solar and clean energy resources, facilities, research and development from companies based in the United States to fulfill the purposes of this chapter.

SEC. 29. Section 25751.5 is added to the Public Resources Code, to read; 25751.5. (a) The Solar and Clean Energy Transmission Account is hereby established within the Renewable Resources Trust Fund.

(b) Beginning January 1, 2009, the total annual adjustments adopted pursuant to subdivision (d) of Section 399.8 of the Public Utilities Code shall be allocated to the Solar and Clean Energy Transmission Account.

(c) Funds in the Solar and Clean Energy Transmission Account shall be used, in whole or in part, for the following purposes:

(1) The purchase of property or right-of-way pursuant to the commission's authority under Chapter 8.9 (commencing with Section 25790).

(2) The construction of, or payment to supplement the construction of, any new or modified electric transmission facilities necessary to facilitate the state achieving its renewables portfolio standard targets.

(d) Title to any property or project paid for in whole pursuant to this section shall vest with the commission. Title to any property or project paid for in part pursuant to this section shall vest with the commission in a part proportionate to the commission's share of the overall cost of the property or project.

(e) Funds deposited in the Solar and Clean Energy Transmission Account shall be used to supplement, and not to supplant, existing state funding for the purposes authorized by subdivision (c).

(f) All projects receiving funding, in whole or in part, pursuant to this section shall be considered public works projects subject to the provisions of Chapter 1 (commencing with Section 1720) of Part 7 of Division 2 of the Labor Code, and the Department of Industrial Relations shall have the same authority and responsibility to enforce those provisions as it has under the Labor Code.

SEC. 30. Chapter 8.9 (commencing with Section 25790) is added to Division 15 of the Public Resources Code, to read:

25790. The Energy Commission may, for the purposes of this chapter, purchase and subsequently sell, lease to another party for a period not to exceed 99 years, exchange, subdivide, transfer, assign, pledge, encumber, or otherwise dispose of any real or personal property or any interest in property. Any such lease or sale shall be conditioned on the development and use of the property for the generation and/or transmission of renewable energy.

25791. Any lease or sale made pursuant to this chapter may be made without public bidding but only after a public hearing.

SEC. 31. Severability

The provisions of this act are severable. If any provision of this act, or part thereof, is for any reason held to be invalid under state or federal law, the remaining provisions shall not be affected, but shall remain in full force and effect.

SEC. 32. Amendment

The provisions of this act may be amended to carry out its purpose and intent by statutes approved by a two-thirds vote of each house of the Legislature and signed by the Governor.

SEC. 33. Conflicting Measures

(a) This measure is intended to be comprehensive. It is the intent of the people that in the event that this measure and another initiative measure relating to the same subject appear on the same statewide election ballot, the provisions of the other measure or measures are deemed to be in conflict with this measure. In the event this measure shall receive the greater number of affirmative votes, the provisions of this measure shall prevail in their entirety, and all provisions of the other measure or measures shall be null and void.

(b) If this measure is approved by voters but superseded by law by any other conflicting ballot measure approved by the voters at the same election, and the conflicting ballot measure is later held invalid, this measure shall be self-

executing and given full force of law.

SEC. 34. Legal Challenge

Any challenge to the validity of this act must be filed within six months of the effective date of this act.

PROPOSITION 8

This initiative measure is submitted to the people in accordance with the provisions of Article II, Section 8, of the California Constitution.

This initiative measure expressly amends the California Constitution by adding a section thereto; therefore, new provisions proposed to be added are printed in *italic type* to indicate that they are new.

SECTION 1. Title

This measure shall be known and may be cited as the "California Marriage Protection Act."

SECTION 2. Section 7.5 is added to Article I of the California Constitution, to read:

Sec. 7.5. *Only marriage between a man and a woman is valid or recognized in California.*

PROPOSITION 9

This initiative measure is submitted to the people of California in accordance with the provisions of Section 8 of Article II of the California Constitution.

This initiative measure amends a section of the California Constitution and amends and adds sections to the Penal Code; therefore, existing provisions proposed to be deleted are printed in ~~strikeout-type~~ and new provisions proposed to be added are printed in *italic type* to indicate that they are new.

PROPOSED LAW

VICTIMS' BILL OF RIGHTS ACT OF 2008: MARSY'S LAW

SECTION 1. TITLE

This act shall be known, and may be cited as, the "Victims' Bill of Rights Act of 2008: Marsy's Law."

SECTION 2. FINDINGS AND DECLARATIONS

The People of the State of California hereby find and declare all of the following:

1. Crime victims are entitled to justice and due process. Their rights include, but are not limited to, the right to notice and to be heard during critical stages of the justice system; the right to receive restitution from the criminal wrongdoer; the right to be reasonably safe throughout the justice process; the right to expect the government to properly fund the criminal justice system, so that the rights of crime victims stated in these Findings and Declarations and justice itself are not eroded by inadequate resources; and, above all, the right to an expeditious and just punishment of the criminal wrongdoer.

2. The People of the State of California declare that the "Victims' Bill of Rights Act of 2008: Marsy's Law" is needed to remedy a justice system that fails to fully recognize and adequately enforce the rights of victims of crime. It is named after Marsy, a 21-year-old college senior at U.C. Santa Barbara who was preparing to pursue a career in special education for handicapped children and had her whole life ahead of her. She was murdered on November 30, 1983. Marsy's Law is written on behalf of her mother, father, and brother, who were often treated as though they had no rights, and inspired by hundreds of thousands of victims of crime who have experienced the additional pain and frustration of a criminal justice system that too often fails to afford victims even the most basic of rights.

3. The People of the State of California find that the "broad reform" of the criminal justice system intended to grant these basic rights mandated in the Victims' Bill of Rights initiative measure passed by the electorate as Proposition 8 in 1982 has not occurred as envisioned by the people. Victims of crime continue to be denied rights to justice and due process.

4. An inefficient, overcrowded, and arcane criminal justice system has failed to build adequate jails and prisons, has failed to efficiently conduct court proceedings, and has failed to expeditiously finalize the sentences and punishments of criminal wrongdoers. Those criminal wrongdoers are being released from custody after serving as little as 10 percent of the sentences imposed and determined to be appropriate by judges.

5. Each year hundreds of convicted murderers sentenced to serve life in prison seek release on parole from our state prisons. California's "release from prison parole procedures" torture the families of murdered victims and waste

millions of dollars each year. In California convicted murderers are appointed attorneys paid by the tax dollars of its citizens, and these convicted murderers are often given parole hearings every year. The families of murdered victims are never able to escape the seemingly unending torture and fear that the murderer of their loved one will be once again free to murder.

6. "Helter Skelter" inmates Bruce Davis and Leslie Van Houghton, two followers of Charles Manson convicted of multiple brutal murders, have had 38 parole hearings during the past 30 years.

7. Like most victims of murder, Marsy was neither rich nor famous when she was murdered by a former boyfriend who lured her from her parents' home by threatening to kill himself. Instead he used a shotgun to brutally end her life when she entered his home in an effort to stop him from killing himself. Following her murderer's arrest, Marsy's mother was shocked to meet him at a local supermarket, learning that he had been released on bail without any notice to Marsy's family and without any opportunity for her family to state their opposition to his release.

8. Several years after his conviction and sentence to "life in prison," the parole hearings for his release began. It is the first parole hearing, Marsy's mother suffered a heart attack fighting against his release. Since then Marsy's family has endured the trauma of frequent parole hearings and constant anxiety that Marsy's killer would be released.

9. The experiences of Marsy's family are not unique. Thousands of other crime victims have shared the experiences of Marsy's family, caused by the failure of our criminal justice system to notify them of their rights, failure to give them notice of important hearings in the prosecutions of their criminal wrongdoers, failure to provide them with an opportunity to speak and participate, failure to impose actual and just punishment upon their wrongdoers, and failure to extend to them some measure of finality to the trauma inflicted upon them by their wrongdoers.

SECTION 3. STATEMENT OF PURPOSES AND INTENT

It is the purpose of the People of the State of California in enacting this initiative measure to:

1. Provide victims with rights to justice and due process.

2. Invoke the rights of families of homicide victims to be spared the ordeal of prolonged and unnecessary suffering, and to stop the waste of millions of taxpayer dollars, by eliminating parole hearings in which there is no likelihood a murderer will be paroled, and to provide that a convicted murderer can receive a parole hearing no more frequently than every three years, and can be denied a follow-up parole hearing for as long as 15 years.

SECTION 4. VICTIMS' BILL OF RIGHTS

SECTION 4.1. Section 28 of Article I of the California Constitution is amended to read:

SEC. 28. (a) The People of the State of California find and declare *all of the following*:

(1) Criminal activity has a serious impact on the citizens of California. The rights of victims of crime and their families in criminal prosecutions are a subject of grave statewide concern.

(2) Victims of crime are entitled to have the criminal justice system view criminal acts as serious threats to the safety and welfare of the people of California. ~~that the~~ The enactment of comprehensive provisions and laws ensuring a bill of rights for victims of crime, including safeguards in the criminal justice system to fully protect ~~protecting~~ those rights and ensuring that crime victims are treated with respect and dignity, is a matter of grave statewide concern ~~high public importance~~. California's victims of crime are largely dependent upon the proper functioning of government, upon the criminal justice system and upon the expeditious enforcement of the rights of victims of crime described herein, in order to protect the public safety and to secure justice when the public safety has been compromised by criminal activity.

(3) The rights of victims pervade the criminal justice system, encompassing not only the right to restitution from the wrongdoers for financial losses suffered as a result of criminal acts, but also the more basic expectation. These rights include personally held and enforceable rights described in paragraphs (1) through (17) of subdivision (b).

(4) The rights of victims also include broader shared collective rights that are held in common with all of the People of the State of California and that are enforceable through the enactment of laws and through good-faith efforts and actions of California's elected, appointed, and publicly employed officials. These rights encompass the expectation shared with all of the people of California that persons who commit felonious acts causing injury to innocent victims will be appropriately and thoroughly investigated, appropriately detained in custody, brought before the courts of California even if arrested

outside the State, tried by the courts in a timely manner, sentenced, and sufficiently punished so that the public safety is protected and encouraged as a goal of highest importance.

(5) Victims of crime have a collectively shared right to expect that persons convicted of committing criminal acts are sufficiently punished in both the manner and the length of the sentences imposed by the courts of the State of California. This right includes the right to expect that the punitive and deterrent effect of custodial sentences imposed by the courts will not be undercut or diminished by the granting of rights and privileges to prisoners that are not required by any provision of the United States Constitution or by the laws of this State to be granted to any person incarcerated in a penal or other custodial facility in this State as a punishment or correction for the commission of a crime.

(6) Victims of crime are entitled to finality in their criminal cases. Lengthy appeals and other post-judgment proceedings that challenge criminal convictions, frequent and difficult parole hearings that threaten to release criminal offenders, and the ongoing threat that the sentences of criminal wrongdoers will be reduced, prolong the suffering of crime victims for many years after the crimes themselves have been perpetrated. This prolonged suffering of crime victims and their families must come to an end.

(7) ~~Such~~ Finally, the People find and declare that the right to public safety extends to public and private primary, elementary, junior high, and senior high school, and community college, California State University, University of California, and private college and university campuses, where students and staff have the right to be safe and secure in their persons.

(8) To accomplish these the goals it is necessary that the laws of California relating to the criminal justice process be amended in order to protect the legitimate rights of victims of crime, ~~broader reforms in the procedural treatment of accused persons and the disposition and sentencing of convicted persons are necessary and proper as deterrents to criminal behavior and to serious disruption of people's lives:~~

(b) In order to preserve and protect a victim's rights to justice and due process, a victim shall be entitled to the following rights:

(1) To be treated with fairness and respect for his or her privacy and dignity, and to be free from intimidation, harassment, and abuse, throughout the criminal or juvenile justice process.

(2) To be reasonably protected from the defendant and persons acting on behalf of the defendant.

(3) To have the safety of the victim and the victim's family considered in fixing the amount of bail and release conditions for the defendant.

(4) To prevent the disclosure of confidential information or records to the defendant, the defendant's attorney, or any other person acting on behalf of the defendant, which could be used to locate or harass the victim or the victim's family or which disclose confidential communications made in the course of medical or counseling treatment, or which are otherwise privileged or confidential by law.

(5) To refuse an interview, deposition, or discovery request by the defendant, the defendant's attorney, or any other person acting on behalf of the defendant, and to set reasonable conditions on the conduct of any such interview to which the victim consents.

(6) To reasonable notice of and to reasonably confer with the prosecuting agency, upon request, regarding, the arrest of the defendant if known by the prosecutor, the charges filed, the determination whether to extradite the defendant, and, upon request, to be notified of and informed before any pretrial disposition of the case.

(7) To reasonable notice of all public proceedings, including delinquency proceedings, upon request, at which the defendant and the prosecutor are entitled to be present and of all parole or other post-conviction release proceedings, and to be present at all such proceedings.

(8) To be heard, upon request, at any proceeding, including any delinquency proceeding, involving a post-arrest release decision, plea, sentencing, post-conviction release decision, or any proceeding in which a right of the victim is at issue.

(9) To a speedy trial and a prompt and final conclusion of the case and any related post-judgment proceedings.

(10) To provide information to a probation department official conducting a pre-sentence investigation concerning the impact of the offense on the victim and the victim's family and any sentencing recommendations before the sentencing of the defendant.

(11) To receive, upon request, the pre-sentence report when available to the defendant, except for those portions made confidential by law.

(12) To be informed, upon request, of the conviction, sentence, place and

time of incarceration, or other disposition of the defendant, the scheduled release date of the defendant, and the release of or the escape by the defendant from custody.

(13) *To Restitution restitution.*

(A) It is the unequivocal intention of the People of the State of California that all persons who suffer losses as a result of criminal activity shall have the right to seek and secure restitution from the persons convicted of the crimes for causing the losses they suffer.

(B) Restitution shall be ordered from the convicted persons wrongdoer in every case, regardless of the sentence or disposition imposed, in which a crime victim suffers a loss, unless compelling and extraordinary reasons exist to the contrary. The Legislature shall adopt provisions to implement this section during the calendar year following adoption of this section.

(C) All monetary payments, monies, and property collected from any person who has been ordered to make restitution shall be first applied to pay the amounts ordered as restitution to the victim.

(14) *To the prompt return of property when no longer needed as evidence.*

(15) To be informed of all parole procedures, to participate in the parole process, to provide information to the parole authority to be considered before the parole of the offender, and to be notified, upon request, of the parole or other release of the offender.

(16) To have the safety of the victim, the victim's family, and the general public considered before any parole or other post-judgment release decision is made.

(17) To be informed of the rights enumerated in paragraphs (1) through (16).

(c) (1) A victim, the retained attorney of a victim, a lawful representative of the victim, or the prosecuting attorney upon request of the victim, may enforce the rights enumerated in subdivision (b) in any trial or appellate court with jurisdiction over the case as a matter of right. The court shall act promptly on such a request.

(2) This section does not create any cause of action for compensation or damages against the State, any political subdivision of the State, any officer, employee, or agent of the State or of any of its political subdivisions, or any officer or employee of the court.

(d) The granting of these rights to victims shall not be construed to deny or disparage other rights possessed by victims. The court in its discretion may extend the right to be heard at sentencing to any person harmed by the defendant. The parole authority shall extend the right to be heard at a parole hearing to any person harmed by the offender.

(e) As used in this section, a "victim" is a person who suffers direct or threatened physical, psychological, or financial harm as a result of the commission or attempted commission of a crime or delinquent act. The term "victim" also includes the person's spouse, parents, children, siblings, or guardian, and includes a lawful representative of a crime victim who is deceased, a minor, or physically or psychologically incapacitated. The term "victim" does not include a person in custody for an offense, the accused, or a person whom the court finds would not act in the best interests of a minor victim.

(f) In addition to the enumerated rights provided in subdivision (b) that are personally enforceable by victims as provided in subdivision (c), victims of crime have additional rights that are shared with all of the People of the State of California. These collectively held rights include, but are not limited to, the following:

(1) Right to Safe Schools. All students and staff of public primary, elementary, junior high, and senior high schools, and community colleges, colleges, and universities have the inalienable right to attend campuses which are safe, secure and peaceful.

(2) Right to Truth-in-Evidence. Except as provided by statute hereafter enacted by a two-thirds vote of the membership in each house of the Legislature, relevant evidence shall not be excluded in any criminal proceeding, including pretrial and post conviction motions and hearings, or in any trial or hearing of a juvenile for a criminal offense, whether heard in juvenile or adult court. Nothing in this section shall affect any existing statutory rule of evidence relating to privilege or hearsay, or Evidence Code Sections 352, 782 or 1103. Nothing in this section shall affect any existing statutory or constitutional right of the press.

(3) Public Safety Bail. A person may be released on bail by sufficient sureties, except for capital crimes when the facts are evident or the presumption great. Excessive bail may not be required. In setting, reducing or denying bail, the judge or magistrate shall take into consideration the protection of the public, the safety of the victim, the seriousness of the offense charged, the

previous criminal record of the defendant, and the probability of his or her appearing at the trial or hearing of the case. Public safety and the safety of the victim shall be the primary consideration considerations.

A person may be released on his or her own recognizance in the court's discretion, subject to the same factors considered in setting bail. However, no person charged with the commission of any serious felony shall be released on his or her own recognizance.

Before any person arrested for a serious felony may be released on bail, a hearing may be held before the magistrate or judge, and the prosecuting attorney and the victim shall be given notice and reasonable opportunity to be heard on the matter.

When a judge or magistrate grants or denies bail or release on a person's own recognizance, the reasons for that decision shall be stated in the record and included in the court's minutes.

(4) Use of Prior Convictions. Any prior felony conviction of any person in any criminal proceeding, whether adult or juvenile, shall subsequently be used without limitation for purposes of impeachment or enhancement of sentence in any criminal proceeding. When a prior felony conviction is an element of any felony offense, it shall be proven to the trier of fact in open court.

(5) Truth in Sentencing. Sentences that are individually imposed upon convicted criminal wrongdoers based upon the facts and circumstances surrounding their cases shall be carried out in compliance with the courts' sentencing orders, and shall not be substantially diminished by early release policies intended to alleviate overcrowding in custodial facilities. The legislative branch shall ensure sufficient funding to adequately house inmates for the full terms of their sentences, except for statutorily authorized credits which reduce those sentences.

(6) Reform of the parole process. The current process for parole hearings is excessive, especially in cases in which the defendant has been convicted of murder. The parole hearing process must be reformed for the benefit of crime victims.

(g) As used in this article, the term "serious felony" is any crime defined in subdivision (c) of Penal Code Section 1192.7(e) of the Penal Code, or any successor statute.

SECTION 5. VICTIMS' RIGHTS IN PAROLE PROCEEDINGS

SECTION 3041.5. Section 3041.5 of the Penal Code is amended to read:

3041.5. (a) At all hearings for the purpose of reviewing a prisoner's parole suitability, or the setting, postponing, or rescinding of parole dates, the following shall apply:

(1) At least 10 days prior to any hearing by the Board of Prison Terms Parole Hearings, the prisoner shall be permitted to review his or her file which will be examined by the board and shall have the opportunity to enter a written response to any material contained in the file.

(2) The prisoner shall be permitted to be present, to ask and answer questions, and to speak on his or her own behalf. Neither the prisoner nor the attorney for the prisoner shall be entitled to ask questions of any person appearing at the hearing pursuant to subdivision (b) of Section 3043.

(3) Unless legal counsel is required by some other provision of law, a person designated by the Department of Corrections shall be present to insure that all facts relevant to the decision be presented, including, if necessary, contradictory assertions as to matters of fact that have not been resolved by departmental or other procedures.

(4) The prisoner and any person described in subdivision (b) of Section 3043 shall be permitted to request and receive a stenographic record of all proceedings.

(5) If the hearing is for the purpose of postponing or rescinding of parole dates, the prisoner shall have rights set forth in paragraphs (3) and (4) of subdivision (c) of Section 2932.

(6) The board shall set a date to reconsider whether an inmate should be released on parole that ensures a meaningful consideration of whether the inmate is suitable for release on parole.

(b) (1) Within 10 days following any meeting where a parole date has been set, the board shall send the prisoner a written statement setting forth his or her parole date, the conditions he or she must meet in order to be released on the date set, and the consequences of failure to meet those conditions.

(2) Within 20 days following any meeting where a parole date has not been set for the reasons stated in subdivision (b) of Section 3043, the board shall send the prisoner a written statement setting forth the reason or reasons for refusal to set a parole date, and suggest activities in which he or she might participate that will benefit him or her while he or she is incarcerated.

(3) The board shall hear each case annually thereafter, except the board may

schedule the next hearing no later than the following, after considering the views and interests of the victim, as follows:

(A) Two years after any hearing at which parole is denied if the board finds that it is not reasonable to expect that parole would be granted at a hearing during the following year and states the bases for the finding; Fifteen years after any hearing at which parole is denied, unless the board finds by clear and convincing evidence that the criteria relevant to the setting of parole release dates enumerated in subdivision (a) of Section 3041 are such that consideration of the public and victim's safety does not require a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner than 10 additional years.

(B) Up to five years after any hearing at which parole is denied if the prisoner has been convicted of murder, and the board finds that it is not reasonable to expect that parole would be granted at a hearing during the following years and states the bases for the finding in writing. If the board defers a hearing five years, the prisoner's central file shall be reviewed by a deputy commissioner within three years at which time the deputy commissioner may direct that a hearing be held within one year. The prisoner shall be notified in writing of the deputy commissioner's decision. The board shall adopt procedures that relate to the criteria for setting the hearing between two and five years. Ten years after any hearing at which parole is denied, unless the board finds by clear and convincing evidence that the criteria relevant to the setting of parole release dates enumerated in subdivision (a) of Section 3041 are such that consideration of the public and victim's safety does not require a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner than seven additional years.

(C) Three years, five years, or seven years after any hearing at which parole is denied, because the criteria relevant to the setting of parole release dates enumerated in subdivision (a) of Section 3041 are such that consideration of the public and victim's safety requires a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner, but does not require a more lengthy period of incarceration for the prisoner than seven additional years.

(4) The board may in its discretion, after considering the views and interests of the victim, advance a hearing set pursuant to paragraph (3) to an earlier date, when a change in circumstances or new information establishes a reasonable likelihood that consideration of the public and victim's safety does not require the additional period of incarceration of the prisoner provided in paragraph (3).

(3) (5) Within 10 days of any board action resulting in the postponement of a previously set parole date, the board shall send the prisoner a written statement setting forth a new date and the reason or reasons for that action and shall offer the prisoner an opportunity for review of that action.

(4) (6) Within 10 days of any board action resulting in the rescinding of a previously set parole date, the board shall send the prisoner a written statement setting forth the reason or reasons for that action, and shall schedule the prisoner's next hearing within 12 months and in accordance with paragraph (2) (3).

(c) The board shall conduct a parole hearing pursuant to this section as a *de novo* hearing. Findings made and conclusions reached in a prior parole hearing shall be considered in but shall not be deemed to be binding upon subsequent parole hearings for an inmate, but shall be subject to reconsideration based upon changed facts and circumstances. When conducting a hearing, the board shall admit the prior recorded or memorialized testimony or statement of a victim or witness, upon request of the victim or if the victim or witness has died or become unavailable. At each hearing the board shall determine the appropriate action to be taken based on the criteria set forth in paragraph (3) of subdivision (a) of Section 3041.

(d) (1) An inmate may request that the board exercise its discretion to advance a hearing set pursuant to paragraph (3) of subdivision (b) to an earlier date, by submitting a written request to the board, with notice, upon request, and a copy to the victim which shall set forth the change in circumstances or new information that establishes a reasonable likelihood that consideration of the public safety does not require the additional period of incarceration of the inmate.

(2) The board shall have sole jurisdiction, after considering the views and interests of the victim to determine whether to grant or deny a written request made pursuant to paragraph (1), and its decision shall be subject to review by a court or magistrate only for a manifest abuse of discretion by the board. The board shall have the power to summarily deny a request that does not comply with the provisions of this subdivision or that does not set forth a change in circumstances or new information as required in paragraph (1) that in the judgment of the board is sufficient to justify the action described in paragraph (4) of subdivision (b).

(3) An inmate may make only one written request as provided in paragraph (1) during each three-year period. Following either a summary denial of a request made pursuant to paragraph (1), or the decision of the board after a hearing described in subdivision (a) to not set a parole date, the inmate shall not be entitled to submit another request for a hearing pursuant to subdivision (a) until a three-year period of time has elapsed from the summary denial or decision of the board.

SECTION 5.2. Section 3043 of the Penal Code is amended to read:

3043. (a) (1) Upon request, notice of any hearing to review or consider the parole suitability or the setting of a parole date for any prisoner in a state prison shall be sent by the Board of Prison Terms Parole Hearings at least 30 90 days before the hearing to any victim of a any crime committed by the prisoner, or to the next of kin of the victim if the victim has died, to include the commitment crimes, determinate term commitment crimes for which the prisoner has been paroled, and any other felony crimes or crimes against the person for which the prisoner has been convicted. The requesting party shall keep the board apprised of his or her current mailing address.

(2) No later than 30 days prior to the date selected for the hearing, any person, other than the victim, entitled to attend the hearing shall inform the board of his or her intention to attend the hearing and the name and identifying information of any other person entitled to attend the hearing who will accompany him or her.

(3) No later than 14 days prior to the date selected for the hearing, the board shall notify every person entitled to attend the hearing confirming the date, time, and place of the hearing.

(b) (1) The victim, next of kin, two members of the victim's immediate family, or and two representatives designated for a particular hearing by the victim or, in the event the victim is deceased or incapacitated, by the next of kin in writing prior to the hearing as provided in paragraph (2) of this subdivision have the right to appear, personally or by counsel, at the hearing and to adequately and reasonably express his, her, or their views concerning the prisoner and the case, including, but not limited to the commitment crimes, determinate term commitment crimes for which the prisoner has been paroled, any other felony crimes or crimes against the person for which the prisoner has been convicted, the effect of the enumerated crimes on the victim and the family of the victim, crime and the person responsible for these enumerated crimes, and the suitability of the prisoner for parole. ~~except that~~

(2) Any statement provided by a representative designated by the victim or next of kin may cover any subject about which the victim or next of kin has the right to be heard including any recommendation regarding the granting of parole. ~~shall be limited to comments concerning the effect of the crime on the victim. The representatives shall be designated by the victim or, in the event that the victim is deceased or incapacitated, by the next of kin. They shall be designated in writing for the particular hearing prior to the hearing.~~

(c) A representative designated by the victim or the victim's next of kin for purposes of this section may be any adult person selected by the victim or the family of the victim must be either a family or household member of the victim. The board may not shall permit a representative designated by the victim or the victim's next of kin to attend a particular hearing, to provide testimony at a hearing, or and to submit a statement to be included in the hearing as provided in Section 3043.2, even though if the victim, next of kin, or a member of the victim's immediate family is present at the hearing, or if and even though the victim, next of kin, or a member of the victim's immediate family has submitted a statement as described in Section 3043.2.

(d) Nothing in this section is intended to allow the board to permit a victim's representative to attend a particular hearing if the victim, next of kin, or a member of the victim's immediate family is present at any hearing covered in this section, or if the victim, next of kin, or member of the victim's immediate family has submitted a written, audiotaped, or videotaped statement.

(e) The board, in deciding whether to release the person on parole, shall consider the entire and uninterrupted statements of the victim or victims, next of kin, immediate family members of the victim, and the designated representatives of the victim or next of kin, if applicable, made pursuant to this section and shall include in its report a statement of whether the person would pose a threat to public safety if released on parole.

in

(e) In those cases where there are more than two immediate family members of the victim who wish to attend any hearing covered in this section, the board may, in its discretion, shall allow attendance of additional immediate family members or limit attendance to the following order of preference to include the following: spouse, children, parents, siblings, grandchildren, and grandparents.

The provisions of this section shall not be amended by the Legislature except by statute passed in each house by roll-call vote entered in the journal; two-thirds of the membership concurring, or by a statute that becomes effective only when approved by the electors.

SECTION 5.3. Section 3044 is added to the Penal Code, to read:

3044. (a) Notwithstanding any other law, the Board of Parole Hearings or its successor in interest shall be the state's parole authority and shall be responsible for protecting victims' rights in the parole process. Accordingly, to protect a victim from harassment and abuse during the parole process, no person paroled from a California correctional facility following incarceration for an offense committed on or after the effective date of this act shall, in the event his or her parole is revoked, be entitled to procedural rights other than the following:

(1) A parolee shall be entitled to a probable cause hearing no later than 15 days following his or her arrest for violation of parole.

(2) A parolee shall be entitled to an evidentiary revocation hearing no later than 45 days following his or her arrest for violation of parole.

(3) A parolee shall, upon request, be entitled to counsel at state expense only if, considering the request on a case-by-case basis, the board or its hearing officers determine:

(A) The parolee is indigent; and

(B) Considering the complexity of the charges, the defense, or because the parolee's mental or educational capacity, he or she appears incapable of speaking effectively in his or her own defense.

(4) In the event the parolee's request for counsel, which shall be considered on a case-by-case basis, is denied, the grounds for denial shall be stated succinctly in the record.

(5) Parole revocation determinations shall be based upon a preponderance of evidence admitted at hearings including documentary evidence, direct testimony, or hearsay evidence offered by parole agents, peace officers, or a victim.

(6) Admission of the recorded or hearsay statement of a victim or percipient witness shall not be construed to create a right to confront the witness at the hearing.

(b) The board is entrusted with the safety of victims and the public and shall make its determination fairly, independently, and without bias and shall not be influenced by or weigh the state cost or burden associated with just decisions. The board must accordingly enjoy sufficient autonomy to conduct unbiased hearings, and maintain an independent legal and administrative staff. The board shall report to the Governor.

SECTION 6. NOTICE OF VICTIMS' BILL OF RIGHTS

SECTION 6.1. Section 679.026 is added to the Penal Code, to read:

679.026. (a) It is the intent of the people of the State of California in enacting this section to implement the rights of victims of crime established in Section 28 of Article I of the California Constitution to be informed of the rights of crime victims enumerated in the Constitution and in the statutes of this state.

(b) Every victim of crime has the right to receive without cost or charge a list of the rights of victims of crime recognized in Section 28 of Article I of the California Constitution. These rights shall be known as "Marsy Rights."

(c) (1) Every law enforcement agency investigating a criminal act and every agency prosecuting a criminal act shall, as provided herein, at the time of initial contact with a crime victim, during follow-up investigation, or as soon thereafter as deemed appropriate by investigating officers or prosecuting attorneys, provide or make available to each victim of the criminal act without charge or cost a "Marsy Rights" card described in paragraphs (3) and (4).

(2) The victim disclosures required under this section shall be available to the public at a state funded and maintained Web site authorized pursuant to Section 14260 of the Penal Code to be known as "Marsy's Page."

(3) The Attorney General shall design and make available in ".pdf" or other imaging format to every agency listed in paragraph (1) a "Marsy Rights" card, which shall contain the rights of crime victims described in subdivision (b) of Section 28 of Article I of the California Constitution, information on the means by which a crime victim can access the web page described in paragraph (2), and a toll-free telephone number to enable a crime victim to contact a local victim's assistance office.

(4) Every law enforcement agency which investigates criminal activity shall, if provided without cost to the agency by any organization classified as a nonprofit organization under paragraph (3) of subdivision (c) of Section 501 of the Internal Revenue Code, make available and provide to every crime victim a "Victims' Survival and Resource Guide" pamphlet and/or video that has been approved by the Attorney General. The "Victims' Survival and

Resource Guide" and video shall include an approved "Marsy Rights" card, a list of government agencies, nonprofit victims' rights groups, support groups, and local resources that assist crime victims, and any other information which the Attorney General determines might be helpful to victims of crime.

(5) Any agency described in paragraph (1) may in its discretion design and distribute to each victim of a criminal act its own Victims' Survival and Resource Guide and video, the contents of which have been approved by the Attorney General, in addition to or in lieu of the materials described in paragraph (4).

SECTION 7. CONFLICTS WITH EXISTING LAW

It is the intent of the People of the State of California in enacting this act that if any provision in this act conflicts with an existing provision of law which provides for greater rights of victims of crime, the latter provision shall apply.

SECTION 8. SEVERABILITY

If any provision of this act, or part thereof, or the application thereof to any person or circumstance is for any reason held to be invalid or unconstitutional, the remaining provisions which can be given effect without the invalid or unconstitutional provision or application shall not be affected, but shall remain in full force and effect, and to this end the provisions of this act are severable.

SECTION 9. AMENDMENTS

The statutory provisions of this act shall not be amended by the Legislature except by a statute passed in each house by roll-call vote entered in the journal, three-fourths of the membership of each house concurring, or by a statute that becomes effective only when approved by the voters. However, the Legislature may amend the statutory provisions of this act to expand the scope of their application, to recognize additional rights of victims of crime, or to further the rights of victims of crime by a statute passed by a majority vote of the membership of each house.

SECTION 10. RETROACTIVITY

The provisions of this act shall apply in all matters which arise and to all proceedings held after the effective date of this act.

## PROPOSITION 10

This initiative measure is submitted to the people in accordance with the provisions of Article II, Section 8, of the California Constitution.

This initiative measure adds sections to the Public Resources Code; therefore, new provisions proposed to be added are printed in *italic type* to indicate that they are new.

### PROPOSED LAW

#### THE CALIFORNIA RENEWABLE ENERGY AND CLEAN ALTERNATIVE FUEL ACT.

SECTION 1. Title.

This measure shall be known and may be cited as "The California Renewable Energy and Clean Alternative Fuel Act."

SECTION 2. Findings and declarations.

The people of California find and declare the following:

A. California's excessive dependence on petroleum products threatens our health, our environment, our economy and our national security.

B. Transportation accounts for 40 percent of California's annual greenhouse gas emissions, and we rely on petroleum-based fuels for an overwhelming 96 percent of our transportation needs. This petroleum dependency contributes to climate change and leaves workers, consumers and businesses vulnerable to price spikes from an unstable energy market.

C. The landmark California Global Warming Solutions Act of 2006 requires California to reduce statewide greenhouse gas emissions to 1990 levels by 2020.

D. Governor Schwarzenegger has issued an executive order establishing a groundbreaking low carbon fuel standard that will reduce the carbon intensity of California's passenger vehicle fuels by at least 10 percent by 2020. This standard is expected to triple the state's renewable fuels market and put 20 times the number of alternative fuel or hybrid vehicles on our roads.

E. Government should provide public funds to meet these policy goals by creating incentives for businesses and consumers to conserve energy and use alternative energy sources.

F. A comprehensive alternative energy strategy must be implemented. This strategy should concentrate on three areas: renewable electricity generation, clean alternative fuels for transportation, and energy efficiency